



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                          |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">American Journal of Experimental Agriculture</a>                             |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2013_AJEA_7269                                                                           |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Genetic control against Striga hermonthica infestation: use of host-plant tolerant maize |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p><b>All over the manuscript:</b> I get confused with the abbreviations (STR, SRT) and the maize variety (IWD SRT, IWD STR and IWD Str). I recommend on not using abbreviation for <i>Striga</i> tolerant maize variety and use a consistent maize variety name.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The words “non tolerant, intolerant and sensitive” should all be changed to “susceptible”.</li> </ul> <p><b>Study design:</b> I suggest this is a 2-way factorial experiment (not 3-way) because the factors are maize varieties and <i>Striga</i> populations. The geographical origin is already included in the 6 populations used. However, it is still possible to analyse the effect of geographical origin separately as in Table 2 and 4. Therefore, I recommend the changes as below.</p> <p><b>Line 10 and 131:</b> Use <b>2-way</b> factorial experiment (not <b>3-ways</b> factorial experiment)</p> <p><b>Line 16-17:</b> Opt out the sentence “The third factor was ..... Ferkessedougou”.</p> <p><b>Line 134-135:</b> Opt out the sentence “The third factor was ..... the three levels.”<br/>-----</p> <p><b>Line 72:</b> I looked at the reference [11] and found that the authors identified <i>Striga</i> emergence as an unreliable trait for maize selection in the abstract. So I think <i>Striga</i></p> | <p><b>All over the manuscript: The correct abbreviation is STR.</b> A consistent maize variety name has been used.</p> <p>The words “<b>non tolerant, intolerant and sensitive</b>” are correct and have been used in many articles. However, they have been changed to “<b>susceptible</b>”.</p> <p><b>Study design:</b> The study design has been changed as follows:<br/><b>Line 10 and 131: Two-way</b> factorial experiment ...<br/><b>Line 131: A 2-way</b> factorial experiment ...</p> <p><b>Line 16-17:</b> “The third factor was ..... Ferkessedougou” has been deleted.</p> <p><b>Line 134-135:</b> “The third factor was ..... Ferkessedougou” has been deleted.</p> <p><b>Line 72:</b> <i>Striga</i> emergence <b>can not be opted out</b> from the appropriate traits for screening maize because in maize research, the number of</p> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|--|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p>emergence should be opted out from the appropriate traits for screening maize. Please also change the sentence in line 72-73 accordingly.</p> <p>Please also state the number of plots (replications) used in section 2.3.</p> <p><b>Line 185 and Table 1:</b> Maize damage score for cultivar IWD Str is not the same (3.78 and 3.27). Which one is correct?</p> <p><b>Line 19, 186 and 332:</b> I calculated and got 51% <math>(2736-1806)*100/1806</math>.</p> <p><b>Table 1:</b> - Change GMRP1 to GMRP18.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- I don't know the significance of grand mean. It may not be necessary if it doesn't convey meaningful implications.</li> <li>- LSD (0.05) of % root lodging is very high. Is it a correct number?</li> <li>- <i>P-var</i> and <i>P-str</i> of % root lodging are different from those shown in Table 3. Which ones are correct?</li> </ul> <p><b>Table 2:</b> Please add footnote "Means with the same letter within line are not significantly different from each other (<math>P = .05</math>) according to LSD test".</p> <p><b>Line 214-222:</b> How can you calculate this? Do you have non-<i>Striga</i> control? If so, please mention it in the methodology section.</p> <p><b>Line 245:</b> Should "higher" be "lower"?</p> | <p>emerged <i>Striga</i> plants is used as the index of resistance (<b>Badu-Apraku et al., 2013</b>). Badu-Apraku B, Yalloub CG, Oyekunle M. Genetic gains from selection for high grain yield and <i>Striga</i> resistance in early maturing maize cultivars of three breeding periods under <i>Striga</i>-infested and <i>Striga</i>-free environments. <b><i>Field Crops Res.</i> 2013;147: 54-67.</b></p> <p>The study specified in the reference [11] is from 2011 and the authors identified <i>Striga</i> emergence as an unreliable trait for maize selection and stated that its inclusion in the base index needs to be further verified. That is specific to the mentioned study. In 2013, the same authors have used <b><i>Striga</i> emergence</b> as appropriate traits for screening maize (<b>Badu-Apraku et al., 2013</b>).</p> <p><b>Line 72-73:</b> The sentence in line 72-73 cannot for the same reason be changed (please see <b>Badu-Apraku et al., 2013</b>)</p> <p>The number of plots (replications) used in section 2.3 is stated<sup>2</sup> on <b>Lines 131-132.</b></p> <p><b>Line 185 and Table 1:</b> Maize damage score for cultivar IWD STR is (3.27).</p> <p><b>Line 19, 186 and 332:</b> 51% is the correct percentage <math>(2736-1806)*100/1806</math>.</p> <p><b>Table 1:</b> - GMRP1 has been Changed to GMRP18. Grand mean is the mean of the means of several subsamples. It is necessary in table 1. It has been</p> |
|--|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



SDI Review Form 1.6

|  |  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|--|--|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  |  | <p>used by Badu –Apraku <i>et al.</i>, (2008):<br/>Badu-Apraku B, Fontem Lum A, Fakorede MAB, Menkir A, Chabi Y, The C, Abdulai M, Jacob S, Agbaje S. Performance of Early Maize Cultivars Derived from Recurrent Selection for Grain Yield and <i>Striga</i> Resistance. <b><i>Crop Sci.</i> 2008; 48:99-112.</b></p> <p>- LSD (0.05) of % root lodging: It is the correct number.<br/><i>P-var</i> and <i>P-str</i> of % root lodging have been corrected in Table 1. Table 3 is correct.</p> <p><b>Table 2:</b> The footnote “Means with the same letter within line are not significantly different from each other (<math>P = .05</math>) according to LSD test”. Has been added.</p> <p><b>Line 214-222:</b> How can you calculate this? <b>This information is obtained by analyzing Table 3.</b></p> <p>We don’t have non-<i>Striga</i> control. However, for calculating the average percent grain yield reductions for both genotypes due to the 6-<i>Striga</i> populations, for example, we process as follows <b><math>[(\text{Maximum yield} - \text{Minimum yield})/\text{Grand mean}] \times 100</math></b>, for genotype GMRP-18 and we do so for genotype IWD STR.</p> |
|--|--|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|---------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> | <p><b>Abstract</b><br/> <b>Line 6:</b> - Use <b>To</b> (capital T) after <b>Aim:</b><br/> -Use <i>Striga hermonthica</i> at the first mention in the text (not <i>S. hermointhica</i>)<br/> <b>Line 7:</b> Use variety instead of varieties<br/> <b>Line 19:</b> Use <math>P &lt; .001</math> instead of <math>P &lt; 0.001</math>.<br/> <b>Line 26-27:</b> The word resistance should be changed to tolerance</p> <p><b>Introduction</b><br/> <b>Line 35-37:</b> - I don't understand the sentence "<i>S. hermonthica</i> severely infested ..... rate of 56.52%". Do you mean <i>S. hermonthica</i> severely infested 57.21% (268,226.1 ha) of farmlands of which maize (108,159.1 ha) is cultivated with an infestation rate of maize 56.25%? If so, please change accordingly.<br/> - Use commas at the numbers of ha.<br/> <b>Line 46:</b> Change <i>its</i> to <i>its</i> (upright letters)<br/> <b>Line 65: symptom damages</b> should be changed to <b>damage symptoms</b>.<br/> <b>Line 71:</b> - Change <b>resistances</b> to <b>resistance</b>.<br/> - Take out the word <b>high</b>.<br/> <b>Line 72:</b> Change <b>04</b> to <b>0.4</b>.<br/> <b>Line 76:</b> Change <b>of</b> to <b>to</b>.<br/> <b>Line 90:</b> Change <b>in</b> to <b>of</b>.</p> <p><b>Materials and methods</b><br/> <b>Line 95:</b> Use hatch symbol ( ' ) instead of upper comma ( ' ) to tell the area position.<br/> <b>Line 98-101:</b> I think it's better to use present tense with singular nouns and verbs in the sentences.<br/> <b>Line 104:</b> - The word <b>Striga</b> must be italics (<i>Striga</i>) – also at line 376 and 392.<br/> - Change <b>varieties</b> to <b>variety</b>.<br/> <b>Line 107:</b> Add <b>is</b> after It.</p> | <p><b>Abstract</b><br/> <b>Line 6:</b> - <b>To</b> (capital T) has been used after <b>Aim:</b><br/> - <i>Striga hermonthica</i> has been used.<br/> <b>Line 7:</b> Use variety instead of varieties<br/> <b>Line 19:</b> Use <math>P &lt; .001</math> instead of <math>P &lt; 0.001</math>.<br/> <b>Line 26-27:</b> The word resistance has been changed to tolerance</p> <p><b>Line 35-37:</b> - Yes we mean "<i>S. hermonthica</i> severely infested 57.21% (268,226.1 ha) of farmlands of which maize (108,159.1 ha) is cultivated with an infestation rate of maize 56.25%"</p> <p><b>Line 46:</b> <i>its</i> has been Changed to <i>its</i>.</p> <p><b>Line 65: symptom damages</b> has been changed to <b>damage symptoms</b>.</p> <p><b>Line 71:</b> - "<b>resistances</b>" has been changed to <b>resistance</b>.<br/> The word <b>high</b> has been taken out.</p> <p><b>Line 72:</b> <b>04</b> has been changed to <b>0.4</b>.<br/> <b>Line 76:</b> Instead of changing "<b>of</b>" to "<b>to</b>", we have used "<b>of controlling</b>".<br/> <b>Line 90:</b> <b>in</b> has been changed to <b>of</b>.</p> <p><b>Materials and methods</b><br/> <b>Line 95:</b> hatch symbol ( ' ) has been used.<br/> <b>Line 98-101:</b> present tense with singular nouns and verbs have been used in the sentences.<br/> <b>Line 104:</b> - The word <b>Striga</b> has been changed in</p> |
|---------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|--|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p><b>Line 112:</b> - Add <b>were</b> before <b>collected</b> and take out <b>were made</b>.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Change <b>in</b> to <b>from</b>.</li> <li>- Change <b>including</b> to <b>, i.e.,</b></li> </ul> <p><b>Line 114:</b> Add <b>samples</b> after <b><i>S. hermonthica</i></b>.</p> <p><b>Line 144-145:</b> The word “and” should be taken out (2 places).</p> <p><b>Line 161:</b> The words “rated such as” should be taken out.</p> <p><b>Line 169:</b> The parenthesis { } can be upright (not italics).</p> <p><b>Results</b></p> <p><b>Line 180, 183, 235 and 237:</b> Add dot after <b>S</b> at <b><i>S hermonthica</i></b>.</p> <p><b>Line 184, Table 1 and Table 2:</b> Remove dot between kg and ha<sup>-1</sup> (kg ha<sup>-1</sup>).</p> <p><b>Line 205 and 304:</b> The word “highly” should be opted out.</p> <p><b>Table 1:</b> At footnote, use upright position (not italics) for : and ; symbols. Change ; symbol after <i>P-var x str</i> to be :</p> <p><b>Table 2, 3 and 4:</b> - <b>s’</b> after population can be taken out (also at line 235).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Use consistent word and style for LSD (0.05)</li> <li>- It isn’t necessary to add <b>s</b> after <b>P-value</b> in the table (also at Table 5).</li> </ul> <p><b>Line 211 and 236:</b> “were” can be changed to “are”.</p> <p><b>Line 237-244:</b> The mean and SE should be expressed as, for example, 5.76 ± 1.28 parasite stems per maize plant.</p> <p><b>Line 238:</b> <b>S</b> at <b>Severity</b> can be changed to a small letter (s).</p> <p><b>Line 244:</b> “slightly” should be changed to “approximately”.</p> <p><b>Line 248:</b> Add “<i>Striga</i>” after “emerged”.</p> <p><b>Line 263, 319 and 321:</b> “a” at “a crop species” should be</p> | <p>italics (<b><i>Striga</i></b>) – also at line 376 and 392.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- “<b>varieties</b>” has been changed to <b>variety</b>.</li> </ul> <p><b>Line 107:</b> “<b>is</b>” has been added after It.</p> <p><b>Line 112:</b> - “<b>were</b>” has been added before <b>collected</b> and “<b>were made</b>” has been taken out</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- “<b>in</b>” has been changed to <b>from</b>.</li> <li>- “<b>including</b>” has been changed to <b>, i.e.,</b></li> </ul> <p><b>Line 114:</b> “<b>populations</b>” instead of <b>samples</b> has been added after <b><i>S. hermonthica</i></b>.</p> <p><b>Line 144-145:</b> The word “and” has been taken out (2 places).</p> <p><b>Line 161:</b> The words “rated such as” have been taken out.</p> <p><b>Line 169:</b> The parenthesis { } have been uprighted (not italics).</p> <p><b>Results</b></p> <p><b>Line 180, 183, 235 and 237:</b> Dot has been added after <b>S</b> at <b><i>S hermonthica</i></b>.</p> <p><b>Line 184, Table 1 and Table 2:</b> Dot has been removed between kg and ha<sup>-1</sup> (kg ha<sup>-1</sup>).</p> <p><b>Line 205 and 304:</b> The word “highly” has been opted out.</p> <p><b>Table 1:</b> At footnote, upright position (not italics) has been used for : and ; symbols.</p> <p><b>Table 2, 3 and 4:</b> - <b>s’</b> after population has been can be taken out (also at line 235).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- consistent word and style has been used for LSD (0.05)</li> <li>- “<b>s</b>” has been removed after <b>P-value</b> in the table (also at Table 5).</li> </ul> |
|--|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|--|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p>taken out.<br/><b>Line 268:</b> Add ,i.e., after <b>hosts</b>.</p> <p><b>Discussion</b><br/><b>Line 291:</b> The word “gain” should be moved to after the word “more”.<br/>Line 294: “<b>USD 0.2 - 0.6 / kg. So</b>” should be changed to “<b>0.2 - 0.6 USD per kg so</b>”.<br/><b>Line 295-296:</b> I don’t understand the phrase “125 to 217 USD .....one hectare of farmland”. Is 125 to 217 USD per any unit?<br/><b>Line 305:</b> Change “There” to “These”.<br/><b>Line 328:</b> Change “appropriated” to “appropriate”.<br/><b>Line 334:</b> The word “to” at the beginning of the line should be taken out.</p> <p><b>References</b><br/><b>References 1, 2 and 16:</b> They are proceedings. The style of writing should conform to each other.<br/><b>Reference 17:</b> The first letter of each word in the paper title should be small letter except the words “Breeding, <i>Striga</i> and Exploitation”.<br/><b>Line 409 and 411:</b> Use capital F for <b>In French</b>.<br/><b>Line 417:</b> Use italics style for <i>Phaseolus vulgaris</i>.</p> | <p><b>Line 211 and 236:</b> “were” has been changed to “are”.<br/><b>Line 237-244:</b> The mean and SE have been expressed as, for example, <math>5.76 \pm 1.28</math> parasite stems per maize plant.<br/><b>Line 238:</b> S at Severity has been changed to a small letter (s).<br/><b>Line 244:</b> “slightly” has been changed to “approximately”.<br/><b>Line 248:</b> “<i>Striga</i>” has been added after “emerged”.<br/><b>Line 263, 319 and 321:</b> “a” at “a crop species” has been taken out.<br/><b>Line 268:</b> ,i.e., has been added after <b>hosts</b>.</p> <p><b>Discussion</b><br/><b>Line 291:</b> The word “gain” has been moved to after the word “more”.<br/>Line 294: “<b>USD 0.2 - 0.6 / kg. So</b>” have been changes to “<b>0.2 - 0.6 USD per kg so</b>”.<br/><b>Line 295-296:</b> It is 125 to 217 USD per one hectare of farmland<br/><b>Line 305:</b> “There” has been changed to “These”.<br/><b>Line 328:</b> “appropriated” has been changed to “appropriate”.<br/><b>Line 334:</b> The word “to” at the beginning of the line has been taken out.</p> <p><b>References</b><br/><b>References 1, 2 and 16:</b> Have been conformed to each other.<br/><b>Reference 17:</b> The reference has been corrected.<br/><b>Line 409 and 411:</b> capital F has been used for <b>In French</b>.</p> |
|--|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                              |
|-----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | <b>Line 417:</b> italics style has been used for <i>Phaseolus vulgaris</i> . |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments | <b>I may have a lot of comments but the study was done and analysed in a logical way. There are some mistakes pertaining writing and the words used. On the overall, I recommend on accepting the manuscript with some revision.</b> |                                                                              |